**REPORT OF A MEETING ON THE WORLD BANK SUPPORTED BETTER EDUCATION SERVICE DELIVERY FOR ALL (BESDA) PROGRAMME FOR RESULT (PforR) OPERATIONS HELD AT THE CONFERENCE ROOM, MINISTRY OF EDUDATION, JIGAWA STATE SEPTEMBER 4 - 5, 2018**

1.0 **INTRODUCTION**

Better Education Service Delivery for All (BESDA) Programme for Result (PforR) Operations became effective January 22, 2018. Most of the beneficiaries States are at a slow phase of programme implementation processes. One of the resolutions during the previous World Bank mission between July 23 and August 3, 2018, was that UBEC with the support of the National Programme Coordinator should conduct consultative meetings where major stakeholders in States would be brought together with a view to ameliorate the process of BESDA implementation.

BESDA is a $611 million dollars World Bank supported Programme with participation of selected 17 States including Jigawa State. The Programme Development Objectives (PDO) are to increase equitable access for out –of- school children, improve literacy and strengthen accountability for results.

So far, the recent visits to Sokoto, Kebbi and Kaduna States have improved, significantly, the level of understanding of BESDA concept which led to the speedy resolution of outstanding issues in the State.

In continuation with consultation with major stakeholders therefore, Jigawa State was visited under the leadership of the BESDA National Programme Coordinator (NPC) with support from the Coordinating Support Team (CST) and Federal Ministry of Education.

The visiting team comprised the following:

1. Prof. Gidado Tahir - NPC, UBEC - Team Leader
2. IRO Umar - DD(SP)/Head CST, UBEC - Member
3. Mrs. Haruna Amina Buba - Deputy Director, FME - “
4. Uchenwoke Ijeoma C. - Asst. Director, FME - “
5. Moses Oyishe - Principal Project Officer, UBEC - “

2.0 **OBJECTIVES OF THE VISIT**

The main objectives of the visit to Jigawa State among other things are to:

1. hold discussions on BESDA implementation issues with the Executive Governors (if available),
2. convene and conduct Technical Sessions with the joint SMoEs – SUBEBs Leaderships and Teams
3. follow-up setting up of:

* BESDA Accounts,
* implementation Teams in the States, and
* discuss the States’ Prior Results (Action plans) based on World Bank’s IVA observations.

The Team was received by the Honourable Commissioners of Education, Science & Technology (MOEST), Executive Chairman, State Universal Basic Education Board (SUBEB), Permanent Members (SUBEB), Directors from the Ministry and SUBEB.

**2.0 ATTENDANCE**

The meeting was attended by some members of the Management and staff of the Ministry (MOEST) and State Universal Basic Education Board (SUBEB).

1. Hon. Commissioner of Education - MOEST
2. Permanent Secretary - MOEST
3. Executive Chairman - SUBEB
4. Directors - MOEST
5. Ag. Director - MOEST
6. Directors - SUBEB
7. Deputy Directors - MOEST
8. Deputy Directors - SUBEB
9. State Project Coordinator - GPE/NIPEP
10. Chief Architect - SUBEB
11. Asst. Chief Officer - SUBEB
12. Social Mobilization Officer - SUBEB
13. Public Relations Officer - MOEST
14. Public Relations Officer - SUBEB
15. Head, EMIS - SUBEB

**3.0 METHODOLOGY TO THE VISIT**

The visit was patterned along two ways. Visits to the State Universal Basic Education Board (SUBEB) and Ministry of Education Science and Technology (MOEST). The event was characterized by remarks by key officials from MOEST, SUBEB, National Programme Coordinator (NPC), and Paper presentation on BESDA by Head of Coordination Support Team/UBEC (CST/UBEC). The Prior Results was also presented by Jigawa SUBEB. There were questions/answers at the end of each presentation for clarity.

**3.1 Visits at the State Universal Basic Education Board (SUBEB)**

The visit commenced with the arrival of the NPC and his Team to the SUBEB. The NPC was formally introduced by the Head CST to the Executive Chairman, Management and staff of the State Universal Basic Education Board (SUBEB). The mission of visit was discussed.

In a brief remark, the NPC said the specific objective of the visit was to have meeting with stakeholders, such as Ministry of Education and SUBEB to clarify issues about their roles and responsibilities in BESDA programme implementation.

The Executive Chairman, SUBEB welcomed the NPC and his Team to the State. In his remarks, he apologized for coming late due to other engagement outside the State. The Executive Chairman expressed his happiness on BESDA programme and pledged that the Board will do everything possible to make sure that the programme is implemented successfully. The Executive Chairman, SUBEB led the NPC and his Team members accompanied by some Management and Staff to the Honourable Commissioner, Ministry of Education, Science and Technology (MOEST).

**3.2 Visits at the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology (MOEST)**

**3.2.1 Introduction of the BESDA National Programme Coordinator (NPC)**

The Head of Coordinating Support Team (CST), IRO Umar formally introduce the NPC, Prof. Gidado Tahir to the Honourable Commissioner, MOEST, SUBEB officials and other Participants. He said the purpose of the meeting was to bring together all stakeholders under the leadership of the National Programme Coordinator to understand the meaning, concept and scope of BESDA as well as their roles and responsibilities.

BESDA is a Nigerian programme in which the World Bank is supporting. The advent of BESDA was the Pillar One which is Out of School Children (OOSC) of the Ministerial Strategic Plan (SMSP) of the Federal Government in which the World Bank was requested to support.

The Operations of BESDA is the normal way operations we have in place. However because of the complex nature of the programme, it is imperative for the Team to visit and have interactions with particular reference to the salient aspects of the BESDA Programme Appraisal Document (PAD) with all stakeholders for the programme to succeed.

**3.2.2 Brief Remark by Mallam Garba G. Makama, Director Planning, Research and Statistics**

In his remark, Mallam Garba Makama appreciated the team for the visit. He said the visit will indeed reveal a lot of issues surrounding BESDA operations in the State. There is no doubt that the areas of weakness will be strengthened to achieve BESDA Programme Development Objective (PDO). He further said BESDA is addressing three result areas. Result Area One addresses out of school children; Result Area two is the issues regarding improving literacy while Result area three is the system strengthening and accountability. He said the team will clarify the strength of the State based on these three result areas and therefore effect corrections where applicable.

**3.2.3 Welcome Remark by Mrs. Rabia Husaini Adamu, Honourable Commissioner, Ministry of Education, Science & Technology (MOEST)**

The Honourable Commissioner, MOEST, Mrs. Rabia Husaini Adamu formally welcomed everyone to the stakeholder’s meeting, particularly the BESDA National Programme Coordinator and his team for the visit. In her remark, she compared the Global Partnership for Education/ Nigeria Partnership for Education (GPE/NIPEP) with the in-coming BESDA programme. She said GPE/NIPEP operations have not been encouraging; and therefore noted with delightfulness that the visiting Team to the State will facilitate smooth BESDA programme implementation among stakeholders. This was because roles and responsibilities will be clarified. The Honourable Commissioner therefore urged participants to be listen attentively and ask questions for clarification where necessary.

**3.2.4 Remark by Prof. Gidado Tahir, BESDA National Programme Coordinator (NPC)**

In his remark Prof. Gidado Tahir, NPC thanked God for bringing together all the stakeholders.

BESDA is about bringing out of school children back to school and is well funded. Therefore there is need to put the teams in place to work together to achieve BESDA Programme Development Objectives (PDO) which are to increase equitable access for out –of- school children, improve literacy and strengthen accountability for results.

He said there is the need to put structure in place as contained in the BESDA Programme Appraisal Document (PAD). This implies that the State Ministry of Education (SoME) assumes the roles and responsibilities of policy and monitoring while State Universal Basic Education Board (SUBEB) is to implement the Programme.

He therefore urged Government to take BESDA Programme very serious. This is because the problem of out of school children in the States have been identified as endemic. Jigawa State and other neighbouring States are also part of the problem.

The World Bank has provided funds to support the Federal Government to bring back children to school; therefore all hands must be on deck to attain the stated objectives. We must put our house in order to access the funds and start making use of it judiciously.

The National Programme Coordinator re-iterated that the programme was designed to achieve results. He also drew the attention of the Honourable Commissioner and the Chairman, SUBEB to take advantage of the initial funds of $3 million US Dollars to start the project. He prayed that the house should be put in order to access the funds.

Again; he said the monitoring and policy role is domiciled in the Ministry while the implementation is at the SUBEB. This is very clear. He urged participants to be attentive for detailed presentation on BESDA.

He therefore thanked all for the opportunity given to share his view.

**4.0 PRESENTATION**

**4.1 An Overview of BESDA by IRO Umar, Head of Coordination Support Team (CST), UBEC**

In his presentation, IRO Umar, Head-CST stated that he was happy that BESDA is not new to the Honourable Commissioner and some members. He reminded the Hon. Commissioner that at a meeting with North-West Governors, funding was identified as a major constraint to educational programmes and activities. He said BESDA was one of the tools identified to solve some educational problems.

The Head of Coordination Support Team, UBEC, IRO Umar presented the paper in two main parts. **Paper 1** was an Overview of BESDA’s key features, focus on states achieving and being rewarded for results. He said that BESDA is a $611 million Dollar project meant to be disbursed to 17 beneficiary States for the period of 5 years upon achievement of results. Beneficiary States are expected to fund 3 main result areas. Results Area 1 deals with increasing equitable access for out-of-school children in focus states which attracted US$341.5 million; Results Area 2 - improving literacy in focus states which attracted US$180 million and Results Area 3 has to do with strengthening accountability for results with allocation of US$56.5 million. The fund would be specifically applied to 5 Disbursement- linked Indicators (DLIs). Each DLI has verification protocols. States that have successfully completed prior results are entitled to $3 million Dollars advance upon request; however, States that mis-manage the fund are expected to pay back. He also said incentives will be given to every child and teachers during the course of implementation. Immediately after this presentation, Mr. Iro requested for a verbal commitment of the Honourable Commissioner which she accented to.

**Part 2** of the presentation was on BESDA implementation: Immediate next steps. The following thematic issues were discussed and agreed as follows:

1. **Set up state teams**
2. Composition of Team at the **MOEST** for policy and monitoring in which relevant Departments and Units are members as follows:

* Director Planning Research And Statistics
* Director Special Duties
* Director School Services
* Director Education Research And Development
* Director Administration And Finance
* Director Of Works
* Director Science And Technology

1. Set up **SUBEB** **Team** for each Result Area. Each result area to be led by a key Director as suggested in the table below:

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **INSTITUTIONAL ARRANGEMENT ON BESDA PROGRAMME IMPLEMENTATION**  **PROGRAMME COORDINATOR: SUBEB CHAIRMAN**  **FOCAL PERSON: DIRECTOR PLANNING, RESEARCH & STATISTICS** | | |
| RESULT ARE | RESPONSIBLE DEPARTMENT | LINKED DEPARTMENTS |
| RESULT AREA 1: INCREASE EQUITABLE ACCESS FOR OOSC | SOCIAL MOBILIZATION | * WORKS * SPECAIL PROGRAMMES * PLANNING, RESEARCH & STATISTICS * PRIMARY * JSS * AGENCY FOR NOMADIC EDUCATION |
| RESULT AREA 2: IMPROVING LITERACY | QUALITY ASSSURANCE | * PRIMARY * JSS * ADMIN & FINANCE * PLANNING, RESEARCH & STATISTICS * SPECIAL PROGRAMME * INTERNAL AUDIT * AGENCY FOR MASS EDUC. |
| RESULT AREA 3: SYSTEM STRENTHENING ACCOUNTABILITY FOR RESULTS | * PLANNING, RESEARCH & STATISTICS | * ADMIN & FINANCE * EMIS * ALL DEPARTMENTS |

1. **Set up state accounts**

Jigawa State was commended for opening four accounts with commercial bank; namely:

* SMoE/SUBEB BESDA Results Account
* SMoE/SUBEB BESDA Advance Account
* SMoE BESDA Technical Assistance Account
* SUBEB BESDA Technical Assistance Account
* **Account signatories** have been determined

1. **Complete prior results**

The team commended SUBEB for successful completion of prior results. It was recommended to prioritize the needs.

1. **Request advance**

* The State was advised to request for advance and use judiciously after the composition of Teams.

1. **Jump-start implementation**

* The Prior results which qualified Jigawa State for $3 million dollars have been submitted by SUBEB. It is currently under-going Independent Verification Agency (IVA) at the World Bank. Again the State has opened accounts for the operation.

**4.2 Presentation of BESDA Prior Results by Mal. Garba G. Makama, DPRS SUBEB**

The Director (PRS), Mal. Garba G. Makamana SUBEB jointly presented the prior results developed and presented to the World Bank for Independent Verification Agency (IVA) through UBEC. However the prior result was presented for further inputs.

In his presentation, the prior result under Result Area 1 shows the distribution of 764,586 (NEDS 2015/ASC 2015) number of out of school children across the 27 LGA of the State. The distribution was based on gender and categories (Almajiri/Tsangaya, Nomad and Special needs). The prior result elicits 15% reduction of out of school children per year for five year.

Areas identified for intervention for bringing back to school the OOSC to mention but few includes :Construction of new additional classrooms, toilets, Teachers in hard to reach areas and Effective schools, Procurement of School furniture, provision of textbooks, establishment of additional Primary schools, advocacy visit, Radio Jingle, Sensitization & Mobilization/House-to-House Campaign visit, inclusiveness and active participation of SBMCs. GPE/NIPEP support on School Grant, Girls Grant, Female Teacher Scholarship, Teacher Professional Development (Training), Construction of toilet blocks at 3No. focal schools with ECD, Procurement of Hausa Textual materials for the take-up (RANA) literacy programme in 2018. TDP support on Pedagogy and lesson plan for Headteachers, Teachers and School Support Officers (SSO)

Similarly, in realising the Result Area 2 as presented, the State will adopt the implementation of RANA Literacy Programme as encapsulated in its’ prior results.

**5.0 GENERAL OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS**

Members were happy with the presentations. However, they offered observations/ recommendations as follows:

* The Hon. Commissioner urged the Chairman SUBEB to urgently forward the institutional implementation arrangement to UBEC;
* Come up with strategies for achieving results;
* Review the Prior Result (Action Plan) to be realistic and achievable or consider less than 15% OOSC reduction rates;
* Apply for advance;
* Adopt Qur’anic school into formal education system;
* Adopt EGRA for ECCDE and MLA for higher level classes;
* Encourage conditional cash transfer;
* Consider school feeding to Almajiri/Tsangaya;
* Agreed to inaugurate BESDA Steering Committee at later date;
* Prioratize activities for achieving results;
* Regular meeting among the Teams should be encouraged; and
* Roles and responsibilities of individuals/stakeholders and Agencies are to be adhered to.

**6.0 CLOSING REMARK/VOTE OF THANKS**

In her closing remark, the Hon. Commissioner, MOEST thanked the NPC and his team for a job well-done. Indeed, the Hon. Commissioner exclaimed the visit of the team has made them to know what BESDA was and how to implement; for prior to arrival of the team they have no sufficient information about BESDA. She prayed to deliver on mandate.

**7.0** **CONCLUSION**

The visit of the National Programme Coordinator, Prof. Gidado Tahir and his Team to Jigawa State was very successful as issues regarding BESDA implementation was cleared to Participants. It is highly recommended that the NPC and CST should follow closely with the States on implementation progress to ensure timely achievement of targets. In this regards, both the NPC and the CST should as a matter of urgency prepare a coordination plan for tracking the State progress.

**Moses Oyishe**