**REPORT OF A MEETING ON THE WORLD BANK SUPPORTED BETTER EDUCATION SERVICE DELIVERY FOR ALL (BESDA) PROGRAMME FOR RESULT (PforR) OPERATIONS HELD AT THE MINISTRY OF EDUDATION, SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY, KADUNA STATE ON THURSDAY - FRIDAY, AUGUST 9 - 10, 2018**

1.0 **INTRODUCTION**

Better Education Service Delivery for All (BESDA) Programme for Result (PforR) Operations is a $611 million dollar World Bank supported programme. The Programme Development Objectives (PDO) of BESDA are to (1) increase equitable access for out –of- school children,(2) improve literacy in focus States and (3) strengthen accountability for results in basic education in Nigeria. The PDO was also align with the priorities of UBE program, reaffirmed in the Ministerial Strategic Plan (MSP) which focus on increasing access, improving quality and equity in basic education.

The implementation of BESDA focused on the six geo-political zones covering 17 States. The Zones/States are: North East (Adamawa, Bauchi, Borno, Gombe, Taraba and Yobe States), North West (Jigawa, Kaduna, Kano, Katsina, Kebbi, Sokoto and Zamfara States), North Central (Niger State), South East (Ebonyi State), South South (Rivers State) and South West (Oyo State).

The Honourable Commissioner of Education, Science and Technology, Kaduna State organized a meeting where relevant stakeholders (Federal and State) were brought together for the **objective** of interaction, clarification or ameliorate the process of BESDA implementation in Kaduna State. The meeting was held at the State Ministry of Education, Science and Technology, Thursday, August 9, 2018. The BESDA National Programme Coordinator (NPC), Prof. Gidado Tahir was invited. The NPC was accompanied by two (2) members of the BESDA Coordination Support Team (CST) of UBE Commission as follows:

1. IRO Umar - Head of Coordination Support Team - UBEC
2. Moses Oyishe - Principal Project Officer - UBEC

The Team was received by the representative of Permanent Secretary (MOEST) who represented the Honourable Commissioners of Education, Science & Technology, Executive Chairman SUBEB, Permanent Members (SUBEB), Directors from the Ministry and SUBEB in the State.

**2.0 ATTENDANCE**

The meeting was attended by some members of Management and staff of the Ministry (MOEST) and State Universal Basic Education Board (SUBEB). The total number of attendance was 19. They are the

1. Permanent Secretary - MOEST
2. Executive Chairman - SUBEB
3. Permanent Secretary - SUBEB
4. Permanent Members (I & II) - SUBEB
5. Directors - MOEST
6. Directors - SUBEB
7. Ag. Director - SUBEB
8. Deputy Director - MOEST
9. Deputy Director - SUBEB
10. SA to Hon. Commissioner - MOEST
11. Monitoring & Evaluation Officer - SUBEB
12. EMIS Officer - SUBEB

**3.0 METHODOLOGY**

The meeting was characterized by remarks by key officials from MOEST, SUBEB, National Programme Coordinator (NPC), and Paper presentation on BESDA by Head of Coordination Support Team/UBEC (CST/UBEC). Prior Results was also presented by Kaduna SUBEB. There was questions/answers at the end of each presentation for clarity.

**4.0 REMARKS**

**4.1 Welcome Remarks by Hon. Commissioner of Education, Science & Technology (MOEST)**

In her welcome remark, the Honourable Commissioner, MOEST ably represented by the Permanent Secretary, MOEST, Mrs. Kande Nana Bage formally welcomed everyone to the meeting. The Permanent Secretary apologized for the absence of the Hon. Commissioner due to official engagement in Lagos State. She said the Hon. Commissioner was aware of the meeting; however his urgent attention was needed outside the State and therefore requested her to represent him.

The Permanent Secretary said BESDA is targeting Out of School Children (OOS). She requested active participation of every one and then wishes a happy deliberation.

**4.2 Remarks by Nasiru Umar, Executive Chairman State Universal Basic Education Board (SUBEB)**

In his remark, the Executive Chairman, SUBEB said the meeting was organized at the instance of the Hon. Commissioner. He said BESDA is a World Bank programme. The programme will be implemented in 17 State of which Kaduna State will be benefited. He described the meeting as forum to discuss and understand BESDA implementation in the State.

**4.3**  **Remarks By Prof. Gidado Tahir, National Programme Coordinator (NPC), BESDA**

In his remark, the National Programme Coordinator, Prof Gidado Tahir commended the State for organizing the meeting. The meeting would provide opportunity for stakeholders to be clarified on BESDA operations.

He said other countries observed that Nigeria has the largest number of Out-of-School Children (OOSC). The Out-Of-School Children (OOSC) constitutes the greatest areas of concern at national and international discourse on educational development. The north has the large number of OOSC.

He explained that BESDA is a $611 million dollars World Bank supported Programme with participation of selected 17 States. The NPC said the Programme Development Objectives (PDO) are to increase equitable access for out –of- school children, improve literacy and strengthen accountability for results.

He said there are processes for BESDA Programme implementation. He said the meeting was to clarify the process.

He commended Kaduna State for being proactive in their activity and hope that the State will sustain it in the implementation of BESDA. He therefore encouraged active participation of every one at the meeting.

**5.0 PRESENTATIONS**

**5.1 An Overview of BESDA by IRO Umar, Head of Coordination Support Team, UBEC**

The Head of Coordination Support Team, UBEC, IRO Umar presented the in two main parts. **Paper 1** was an Overview of BESDA’s key features, including the focus on states achieving and being rewarded for results. He said that BESDA is a $611 million Dollars meant to be disbursed to 17 beneficiary States for the period of 5 years upon achievement of results. Beneficiary States are expected to fund 3 main result areas. Results Area 1 has to do with increasing equitable access for out-of-school children in focus states and attracted US$341.5 million; Results Area 2 - improving literacy in focus states which attracted US$180 million and Results Area 3 centres on Strengthening accountability for results with allocation of US$56.5 million. The fund would be specifically applied to 5 Disbursement- linked Indicators (DLIs). Each DLI has verification protocols. Each States attracts entitling to $3 million Dollars advance upon successful prior results; however, States that mis-manage the fund are expected to pay back. He also said incentives will be given to every child and teachers during the course of implementation.

**Part 2** of the presentation was on BESDA implementation: Immediate next steps. The following thematic issues were discussed and agreed as follows:

1. **Set up state teams**
2. Composition of Team at the **MOEST** for policy and monitoring in which relevant Departments and Units will be a member.

(ii) Set up **SUBEB** **Team** for each Result Area. Each result area to be led by a key Director as PDO suggest below:

* **Result Area (1)**: Increasing equitable access for out-of-school Children in focus States - PDO indicator: Reduced number of out-of-school children in focus States, by gender;
* **Result Area (2)** Improving literacy in focus States

PDO indicator: Improved literacy rates in focus States, by State; and

* **Result Area (3)** Strengthening accountability for result PDO indicator: Publicly disclosed UBE Programme Strategic plan reflecting annual progress reports and programme evaluation finding

1. **Set up state accounts**

Kaduna State was commended for opening four accounts with commercial bank; namely:

* SMoE/SUBEB BESDA Results Account
* SMoE/SUBEB BESDA Advance Account
* SMoE BESDA Technical Assistant Account
* SUBEB BESDA Technical Assistant Account
* **Account signatories** have been determined

1. **Complete prior results**

The team commended SUBEB for successful completion of prior results. It was recommended to prioritize the needs.

1. **Request advance**

* The State was advised to request for advance and use judiciously after the composition of Teams.

1. **Jump-start implementation**

* The Prior results which qualified Kaduna State for $3 million dollars has been submitted by SUBEB. It is currently under-going Independent Verification Agency (IVA) at the World Bank. Again the State has opened accounts for the operation. However, it was observed with concern that Kaduna State has not yet set up Teams and was advised to urgently commence the process to qualify for BESDA implementation without further delay.

**5.1.1 Roles and Responsibilities of Teams**

To mention but few roles and responsibilities of the teams as given by the presenter include:

* regular meeting;
* submission of progress report to MOEST every quarter;
* involvement of MOEST in planning activities;
* communication flow.
* etc

**5.2 Presentation of BESDA Prior Results by Kaduna SUBEB**

The Director (PRS), Ibrahim Amiu and Josephine R. Michael, EMIS Officer Kaduna SUBEB jointly presented the prior results developed and presented to the World Bank for Independent Verification Agency (IVA) through UBEC. However the prior result was presented for further inputs.

In his presentation, the prior result under Result Area 1 shows the distribution of 727,766 (NEDS 2015/ASC 2015) number of out of school children across the 23 LGA of the State. The distribution was based on gender and categories (Almajiri/Tsangaya, Nomad and others). The prior result elicits 20% reduction of out of school children per year for five year.

Areas identified for intervention for bringing back to school the OOSC to mention but few includes (1) Meeting with CSOs on getting them involved in the programme/strategy planning for the advocacy and sensitization to community members on enrolment of out of school children and other related issues, (2) Conduct capacity building on Advocacy and Sensitization, enrolment campaign strategies as well as child protection issues to LGEA staff and CSOs at four zonal training centres, (3) Conduct State level Sensitization and Advocacy on enrolment of out of school children to technocrats and other relevant Stakeholders, (4) Capacity development of SBMC officials on enrolment of out of school children and their retention in school, (5) Provision of more Classrooms/Furniture to accommodate new comers, etc.

Similarly, in realising the Result Area 2 as presented, the State will expand the implementation of RANA Literacy Programme to other non RANA LGEAs as encapsulated in its’ prior results.

**6.0 GENERAL OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS**

Members were happy with the presentations. However, they offered observations/ recommendations as follows:

* The Hon. Commissioner to package communication strategies among the team;
* Urgent need to have BESDA Teams constituted at MOEST and SUBEB communicate to the NPC/UBEC not later than Friday, August, 10, 2018;
* Review the Prior Result (Action Plan) to be realistic and achievable;
* Construction of classrooms, provision of furniture, enrolment campaign should be encouraged;
* Encourage conditioner cash transfer;
* Agreed to inaugurate BESDA Steering Committee;
* Regular meeting among the Teams should be encouraged; and
* Roles and responsibilities of individuals/stakeholders and Agencies are to be adhere to.

**7.0 CLOSING REMARK/VOTE OF THANKS**

In her closing remark, The Permanent Secretary who represented the Honourable Commissioner, MOEST promised to convey the outcome of the meeting to her principal and that the State will do everything possible to achieve the aims and objectives of BESDA.

Similarly, the Executive Chairman, SUBEB thanked the World Bank and the Federal Government for chosen Kaduna State to participate in BESDA. He also appreciated the National Programme Coordinator and his Team for honouring the invitation. He said now that the BESDA implementation process has been clarified, the state will work hard to achieve the stated objectives.

In his closing remarks, the NPC thanked all for active participation and wishes the State smooth BESDA implementation.

**8.0** **CONCLUSION**

The visit of the National Programme Coordinator, Prof. Gidado Tahir to Kaduna State was very successful as issues regarding BESDA implementation was cleared to Participant. It is highly recommended that the NPC and CST should follow closely with the States implementation progress to ensure timely achievement of targets. In this regards, both the NPC and the CST should as a matter of urgency prepare a coordination plan for tracking the State progress.

**Moses Oyishe**