**REPORT OF A MEETING ON THE WORLD BANK SUPPORTED BETTER EDUCATION SERVICE DELIVERY FOR ALL (BESDA) PROGRAMME FOR RESULT (PforR) OPERATIONS HELD AT THE CONFERENCE ROOM, MINISTRY OF EDUDATION, KANO STATE SEPTEMBER 6, 2018**

1.0 **INTRODUCTION**

Better Education Service Delivery for All (BESDA) Programme for Result (PforR) Operations became effective January 22, 2018. Most of the beneficiaries States are at a slow phase of programme implementation processes. One of the resolutions during the previous World Bank mission between July 23 and August 3, 2018, was that UBEC with the support of the National Programme Coordinator should conduct consultative meetings where major stakeholders in States would be brought together with a view to ameliorate the process of BESDA implementation.

 BESDA is a $611 million dollars World Bank supported Programme with participation of selected 17 States including Kano State. The Programme Development Objectives (PDO) are to increase equitable access for out –of- school children, improve literacy and strengthen accountability for results.

So far, the recent visits to Sokoto, Kebbi and Kaduna States have improved, significantly, the level of understanding of BESDA concept which led to the speedy resolution of outstanding issues in these States.

In continuation with consultation with major stakeholders therefore, Kano State was visited under the leadership of the BESDA National Programme Coordinator (NPC) with support from the Coordinating Support Team (CST) and Federal Ministry of Education.

The visiting team comprised the following:

1. Prof. Gidado Tahir - NPC, UBEC - Team Leader
2. IRO Umar - DD(SP)/Head CST, UBEC - Member
3. Mrs. Haruna Amina Buba - Deputy Director, FME - “
4. Uchenwoke Ijeoma C. - Asst. Director, FME - “
5. Moses Oyishe - Principal Project Officer, UBEC - “

2.0 **OBJECTIVES OF THE VISIT**

The main objectives of the visit to Kano State among other things are to:

1. hold discussions on BESDA implementation issues with the Executive Governors (if available),
2. convene and conduct Technical Sessions with the joint SMoEs – SUBEBs Leaderships and Teams
3. follow-up setting up of:
* BESDA Accounts,
* implementation Teams in the States, and
* discuss the States’ Prior Results (Action plans) based on World Bank’s IVA observations.

The Team was received by the Honourable Commissioners of Education, Science & Technology (MOEST), Executive Chairman, State Universal Basic Education Board (SUBEB), Permanent Secretaries (SUBEB), Directors from the Ministry and SUBEB.

**2.0 ATTENDANCE**

The meeting was attended by some members of the Management and staff of the Ministry (MOEST) and State Universal Basic Education Board (SUBEB).

1. Hon. Commissioner of Education - MOEST
2. Permanent Secretaries - MOEST
3. Executive Chairman - SUBEB
4. Directors - MOEST
5. Directors - SUBEB
6. Deputy Directors - MOEST
7. Deputy Directors - SUBEB

**3.0 METHODOLOGY TO THE VISIT**

The event was characterized by remarks by key officials from MOEST, SUBEB, National Programme Coordinator (NPC), and Paper presentation on BESDA by Head of Coordination Support Team/UBEC (CST/UBEC). The Prior Results was also presented by Jigawa SUBEB. There were questions/answers at the end of each presentation for clarity. Members were group into two, MOEST and SUBEB. Each group was assigned to form a team for BESDA implementation in line with Programme Appraisal Document (PAD). The groups were supported by officials of FME and SUBEB respectively.

The meeting was moderated by Amina umar, the Director, Social Mobilisation (DSM), Kano State Universal Basic Education Board (SUBEB). The DSM introduced the Hononourable Commissioner, Permanent Secretaries and the Management Staff in the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology Kano State and also the Executive Chairman, members of Management and Staff of Kano Universal Basic Education Board to the National Programme Coordinator and his Team from Abuja. She said the Team was led by the NPC – BESDA.

She briefly stated that the meeting was about World Bank supported Better Education Service Delivery for All (BESDA) – Programme for Results (PforR) operation.

**4.0 REMARKS/ADDRESSES**

**4.1 Welcome Address by Mal. Zakari I. Bagwai, Executive Chairman, State Universal Basic Education Board**

In his welcome address, Mal. Zakari I. Bagwai, the Executive Chairman, State Universal Basic Education Board, formally welcomed Prof. Gidado Tahir, the National Programme Coordinator and his Team. He said BESDA is an acronym for Better Education Service Delivery for All – Programme for Results (PforR) Operation and was being supported by the World Bank targeting Out of School Children (OOSC). He said the Programme was aimed at achieving three (3 results areas: 1. Access, 2. Improving Learning and 3 systems strengthening.

The Programme will be implemented in 17 states, 3 in the southern and 14 in the northern states of which Kano State was one of the focus States. The program was introduced about 2 years ago.

He informed the meeting that Kano State has gone very far with implementation processes. According to him, what was left was tightening the bolt and greasing the few areas. He said that we should be sacrosanct, because Kano State is interested on the Programme. He asserts that Kano State is the China of Nigeria with densely population, hence dire need of interventions in the area of basic education. BESDA was meant to improve education in the State, it is a welcome development.

He also said that we should not lost site on what GPE/NIPEP was doing. After Programme, we are going to have better education service delivery for all.  Kano State has the larger scope on education. The available statistics revealed that the State has over 4 million at the last head count of which over 2 million are out of school children,roaming about the street.

Executive chairman said that he was interested in a particular component of the Programme, the improving learning outcome. He explained further that the essence of education was to provide learning, access and improve quality of education.

 The team was going to present paper on BESDA for better understanding. The attainment of objective of the programme depends on our commitment. He therefore wish participant a fruitful meeting.

**4.2 Remark by Prof. Gidado Tahir, BESDA National Programme Coordinator (NPC)**

 In his remark Prof. Gidado Tahir, the National Programme Coordinator for BESDA thanked the Honourable Commissioner, MOEST for audience out of his busy schedule. He said the objective of the visit among things was to clarify what is Better Education Service Delivery for All (BESDA), the scope and implementation processes involved.

BESDA is about bringing out of school children back to school and is well funded. Therefore there is need to put the teams in place to work together to achieve BESDA Programme Development Objectives (PDO) which are to increase equitable access for out –of- school children, improve literacy and strengthen accountability for results.

The NPC said BESDA was meant for basic education program and not the World Bank. The Federal Government of Nigeria is compassionate about education that is why the Government decided to take loan from the Bank Programme.

He commended Kano State for the efforts made on BESDA so far by setting up teams; even though it was not in line with the PAD, provision of the prior results and account opening for the Programme.

He said the Team visits the State specifically to clarify the key structure of the program for smooth operations. He explained the roles and responsibilities for each Agency in the State as provided in the Programme Appraisal Document. The State Ministry of Education has the roles and responsibilities of policy and monitoring while the State Universal Basic Education Board implements the programme. He therefore urged participant to listen very attentively to the IRO Umar, Head Coordinating Support Team (CST), who will present paper on BESDA for better understanding.

**5.0 PRESENTATION**

**5.1 An Overview of BESDA by IRO Umar, Head of Coordination Support Team (CST), UBEC**

 **(a) Preamble**

In his presentation the IRO Umar, Head CST said Nigeria has the highest number of out of school children followed by pakistan. This is a concern to the Federal Government and that was why Government decided to take the challenges of out of school children very serious. Pillar one of the Ministry’s Ministerial Strategic Plan (MSP) is the out of school children and a top priority areas of Government.

When the Federal Government of Nigeria approached the World Bank for a support, the money was approved by the Bank to Pillar 1 MSP which is out of school children and that is why we have Better Education Service Delivery for All (BESDA).

The Head, CST formally introduced the BESDA National Programme Coordinator in the persons of Professor Gidado Tahir, who is not a new person to almost all of us. Professor Gidado Tahir was the founder of the Universal Basic Education Commission. The disbursement of funds to SUBEB which began up till today started with his idea during President Olusegun Obasanjo Administration.

When BESDA came into existence, and UBE Commission was looking for the NPC, he was found to be the most suitable for the post and therefore appointed based on his wealth of experience.  Although he did not agree but after series of debate, he agreed and that was why we are having him here.

**(b) Highlight of the presentation**

* BESDA is about bringing the out of school children back to school.
* BESDA has a lot of incentives for bringing back to school children.
* Institutional arrangement should be put in place for the operations, it involved setting up of implementation Teams both at State Ministry of Education and State Universal Basic Education Board. Also teams are composed in accordance with three (3) result areas with the support of technical officers and the teams are expected to come up with work plan.
* The roles and responsibilities of MOEST is policy and monitoring while the Programme implementation is domicile at SUBEB.
* Kano State is qualified for $300 million dollars for putting together Prior Results
* There are five (5) Account to be opened. (1) Advance Account (This is optional for State to reques), (2)Results Account (This is the main account for the Programme), and (3) Two (2) Technical Assistance Account (each for MoE and SUBEB which serve as imprest).
* The prior results qualify the State for $3 Million Dollars, this was commended.

**5.1.2 Presentation by Mustapha, State Universal Basic Education Board**

**Highlights of the presentation:**

1. **Result Area 1: Increasing equitable access for out-of-school children**
* Segregated the data by LGAs and categories of Gender, Almajiri, Nomad and others for achieving result. The segregated data was focused on basic education children.
* The State has higher number of out of school children compared to National Education Data Survey (NEDS).
* The State targeted 10% reduction of number of out of school children, but was advised to reduce to achievable rate of 8% in one of the meetings with BESDA Team from Worthington in Abuja. The state targeted 50% achievement/reduction number of out of school children at the end of the 5 years.
* Strategies for reducing the number of out of school children are feeding, provision of textbook, infrastructure, mobilization, provision of mats, training and retraining Alaramas, incentives, farm implements, instructional materials etc.

**Results Area 2: Improving literacy**

* The State will adopt 2016/2017 UNICEF data survey for literacy programme with target rate of 10%.
* Adoption of RANA and Jolly Phonetic literacy programme
* Provision of textbooks, training the training of teachers, etc.

**6.0 DISCUSSIONS/RESOLUTIONS**

 At the end of the presentations the following resolutions were reached.

**6.1 State Policy and Monitoring Team** at the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology (MOEST). This was to be forwarded to UBE Commission officially.

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | **State Ministry of Education** | **State Project Management Team**  |
| **1.** | **RESULT AREA (3)**:strengthening accountability for results | 1.**Lead Person-Muhammed Falalu-Director PRS**2. Aisha Ado D(ESS)3.Garba U. Gombe D(KERD)**4**. Sinusi M. Umar DD(Accounts)5. Aminu Ahmad Chief Stores Officers |
| **2.** | **MINISTRY’S TECHNICAL SUPPORT TEAM** |
| 1. | Deputy Director KERD | **Sani Mohammed PROJECT COORDINATOR** |
| 2. | Deputy Director (ESS) | Bala Ilu - Support Officer |
| 3. | Assistant Director (PRS) | Ado Abubakar |

6.2 **Implementation Team** at the State Universal Basic Education Board. This is to be communicated to the Commission.

|  |
| --- |
| **RESULT AREA 1: Increasing Access for OOSC** |
| 1. | Director Social Mobilization | Lead Director |
| 2. | Director Physical Planning |  |
| 3. | Coordinator Special Education |  |
| 4. | Coordinator IQTE |  |
| 5. | Director Nomadic |  |
| 6 | DD/ Donors |  |
| 7. | DD/ Community |  |
| 8. | DD/New Project |  |
|  |  |
| **RESULT AREA 2: Improving Literacy**  |  |
| 1. | Director School Services | Lead Director |
| 2. | Deputy Director Quality Assurance |  |
| 3. | DD/Support Services |  |
|  | Coordinator Academic Services Unit |  |
| **RESULT AREA: 3 Strengthening Management and Accountability** |
| 1. | Director PRS | Lead Director |
| 2. | Director School Services | Member |
| 3. | Director Finance | Member |
| 4. | Director Personnel Management | Member |
| 5. | DD/Statistics &EMIS | Program Analyst/EMIS |
| 6. | DD/Research & Library | Member |
| 7. | DD/Tender | Procurement |
| 8. | DD/Finance | Project Accountant |
| 9. | Auditor | Project Auditor |
| 10. | DD Lands | Safe Guards |

**5.0 GENERAL OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS**

Members offered observations/ recommendations as follows:

* The 8% target for reducing number of out of school children in the state was significant.
* Kano state is experiencing shortage of classrooms. Hopefully, BESDA would provide solution to inadequate classrooms that will affect learner’s outcome positively.
* Government should complement the efforts of IDPs in the areas of infrastructure, textbooks, etc.
* BESDA focused on basic education without senior secondary school and tertiary education. The implication is that the product of basic education into tertiary institutions will be affected. It was however established that education cannot provide everything; the foundation of basic education is the key to become a better citizen in the society. It is expected that the product of basic education can take care of their selves at higher institutions such as Colleges of Education, Technical Colleges and Universities for higher qualifications. Besides, the Federal Ministry of Education introduced entrepreneur curriculum for skill acquisition at the end of 9-year basic education, would have access to some entrepreneur program which will help them in future endeavor.
* Kano state has not been given adequate attention to entrepreneurship program because of political interference with our educational system. This is a major challenge to the state.
* All the strategies for achieving results should be Prioritize for convenient monitoring.
* The State does not have any outstanding issue regarding Account Opening except setting up a team according to Programme Appraisal Document (PAD).

**6.0 SPECIFIC OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS BY AGENCIES**

 The Honourable Commission requested for specific observations/recommendations by Agencies, hence offered below

1. **The National Programme Coordinator (NPC) AND UBEC**

The NPC expressed his satisfaction about the conduct of the meeting. He said BESDA was well understood. He appealed to members of the teams both at the Ministry and SUBEB to synergize for achieving the Programme Development Objective (PDO).

Also regular meeting of team members should not be over-emphasized and should be encouraged. The meeting is an opportunity for members to discuss and plan strategies for achieving results.

1. **Coordinating Support Team/Federal Ministry of Education**

The Officials from the Federal Ministry of Education said access to quality education is the bedrock for any developing country. The State, therefore should to take the BESDA more serious by exploring the possible ways of getting out of school children back to school in all ramification. He reminded and cautioned all to be mindful of the loan collected from the World Bank in support of BESDA by the Federal Government, the funds should be applied strictly to BESDA and by the end of the Programme, the Federal Government will pay.

It was observed and reminded members that when children are educated, they turn out to become a better children in the society, because they will be happy and enlightened.

1. **Executive Chairman, State Universal Basic Education Board (SUBEB)**

The Chairman, State Universal Basic Education Board expressed his happiness to members for active participation. He said the meeting was essentially for SUBEB. He said the Board will do everything possible to make sure that the program becomes successful. The State ministry of Education has provided enabling environment for this program.

1. **Permanent Secretary, Ministry of Education, Science and Technology (MOEST)**

The Permanent Secretary, MOEST responded to the issues concerning the product of basic education. In his response, he said the State, as far back as 2009 has developed a master plan to address this challenge. The plan is being financed every year through budget.

Concerning BESDA, he said the visit/meeting of today provided him with in-depth understanding about the concept, scope and how to implement the programme. He thanked the National Programme Coordinator, Team and the UBE Commission for the visit to Kano State and clarified issues concerning BESDA programme.

He also observed that a project of this nature required experience of the past. He hoped that the result areas will provide the required results. He also said transparency and accountability are the very key to the success of the program. He pledged that the State will work to achieve better results. He thanked the Honourable Commissioner and the Team for the meeting.

**7.0 CLOSING REMARK/VOTE OF THANKS BY THE HON. COMMISSIONER**

 In his closing remark, the Hon. Commissioner observed that BESDA has 17 beneficiary States including Kano. The State can access the fund based on achieving results. He also said that the State Government has plan for Education.

 He said that the team has made BESDA issues very clear to all and therefore assured that the State will to do everything possible for the smooth implementation of the program me.

 He also observed that BESDA was designed to move the country forward and also the implementation team will put in place strategies in accordance with the PAD for smooth operation. He thanked the National Program Coordinator and his team members for the job well done.

**8.0** **CONCLUSION**

The visit of the National Programme Coordinator, Prof. Gidado Tahir and his Team to Kano State was very successful as issues regarding BESDA implementation was cleared to Participants. It is highly recommended that the NPC and CST should follow closely with the States on implementation progress to ensure timely achievement of targets. In this regards, both the NPC and the CST should as a matter of urgency prepare a coordination plan for tracking the State progress.

**Moses Oyishe**