**REPORT OF A TWO-DAY WORLD BANK MISSION ON BETTER EDUCATION SERVICE DELIVERY FOR ALL (BESDA) PROGRAMME FOR RESULT (PforR) OPERATIONS HELD IN KEBBI STATE ON TUESDAY, JULY 31 TO WEDNESDAY AUGUST 1, 2018**

1.0 **INTRODUCTION**

Better Education Service Delivery for All (BESDA) Programme for Result (PforR) Operations is a 611 million dollar World Bank supported programme. The BESDA Programme Development Objective (PDO) is to (1) increase equitable access for out –of- school children,(2) improve literacy in focus States and (3) strengthen accountability for results in basic education in Nigeria. The PDO is also align with the priorities of UBE program, reaffirmed in the Ministerial Strategic Plan (MSP) which focus on increasing access, improving quality and equity in basic education.

The Bank is supporting the implementation of BESDA in the six geo-political zones in the 17 out of 37 States and FCT, Abuja. The Zones/States are: North East (Adamawa, Bauchi, Borno, Gombe, Taraba and Yobe States), North West (Jigawa, Kaduna, Kano, Katsina, Kebbi, Sokoto and Zamfara States), North Central (Niger State), South East (Ebonyi State), South South (Rivers State) and South West (Oyo State).

It was against this background that World Bank planned BESDA and Analystical Work on Education Spending Implementation Support Mission visit from Washington DC to Nigeria from July 23 to August 3, 2018. The Mission visit was led by Dina Abu-Ghaida (Lead Economist, BESDA co-task leader).

The objectives of the mission among other things were to:

1. undertake visits to selected States to hold discussions on BESDA implementation with the Governors, State Ministries of Education and State Universal Basic Education Boards;
2. follow-up on setting up of accounts at the federal and state levels;
3. follow-up on disbursement for prior results;
4. follow-up on contracting of Independent Verification Agents by the Federal Ministry of Finance; and
5. follow-up on state requests for advances.

The Bank’s team, in collaboration with the Federal Government Agencies (Federal Ministries of Education and Finance; and Universal Basic Education Commission) scheduled a working visit to Kebbi State from Tuesday, July 31 – August 1, 2018. The visiting team was:

1. Dina Abu-Ghaida (Lead Economist, BESDA Co-task team leader) World Bank;
2. Aisha Garba (Education Specialist) - World Bank;
3. Haruna Amina Buba (Deputy Director) - Federal Ministry of Education
4. IRO Umar (Deputy Director (Special Projects)) – Universal Basic Education Commission;
5. Kigbu Audu Johnson – Chief Education Officer, Federal Ministry of Education;
6. A representative from the Federal Ministry of Finance; and
7. Moses Oyishe (Senior Project officer) - Universal Basic Education Commission

The team was received by His Excellency, the Executive Governors of Kebbi State, Commissioner of Education, Permanent Secretary (SMoE), Executive Chairman, State Universal Basic Education Board (SUBEB) and other dignitaries in the State.

**2.0 ATTENDANCE**

The meeting was attended by top government functionaries and stakeholders in education sector as follows:

1. State Ministry of Education (SMoE);
2. State Universal Basic Education Board (SUBEB);
3. Agency for Mass Education (AME);
4. Arabic and Islamic Education Board (AIEB)

**3.0 Remark by Dina Abu-Ghaida, BESDA Task Team Leader (TTL), World Bank**

In her remark, the BESDA TTL, Dina Abu-Ghaida introduced members of the Team. She said the objective of the visit was to interact with His Excellency, the Executive Governor, top government functionaries, officials of the State Ministry of Education (SMoE), State Universal Basic Education Board (SUBEB), and other relevant personnel/Agencies regarding BESDA implementation.

**3.1 Welcome remark by Mohammadu Magawata Aliero, Commissioner of Education (COE), Kebbi State**

The Commissioner of Education Kebbi State, Mohammadu Magawata Aliero formally welcomed all to the meeting, especially the visiting team to the State. He described the visit as a welcome development and would complement the efforts of the State Government in the area of Education. He said the State will explore every avenue for BESDA to succeed. He wishes a happy deliberation. At this juncture, he led the TTL, World Bank, Dina and the Programme Coordinator, FME, Haruna Amina Buba to His Excellency, Abubakar Atiku Bagudu, the Executive Governor, Kebbi State.

**4.0 INTERACTIVE SESSION**

The meeting in Kebbi State was divided into two (2) interactive sessions, technical and courtesy visit to His Excellency, Abubakar Atiku Bagudu, Executive Governor of Kebbi State.

**4.1 Technical Meeting with State Ministry of Education and State Universal Basic Education Board**

The Technical Session was jointly presided by Aisha Garba, Education Specialist, World Bank and IRO Umar, Deputy Director (Special Projects), Universal Basic Education Commission.

**4.1.1 Paper Presentation on BESDA**

During the technical session, presentation was divided into two main parts. Part 1 was anchored by Aisha Garba of the Bank. Paper 1 was an Overview of BESDA’s key features, including the focus on states achieving and being rewarded for results. She explained that BESDA is a $611 million Dollars meant to be disbursed to 17 beneficiary States for the period of 5 years upon achievement of results. She said that States are expected to fund 3 key main result areas. Results Area 1: Increasing equitable access for out-of-school children in focus states would attract US$341.5 million; Results Area 2: Improving literacy in focus states attracts US$180 million and Results Area 3: Strengthening accountability for results allocated US$56.5 million. The fund would be specifically applied to 5 Disbursement- linked Indicators (DLIs). Each DLI has verification protocols. Each States is entitling to $3 million Dollars advance upon successful prior results; however, States that mis-manage the fund are expected to paid back. She also said incentives will be given every child

Part 2 of the presentation was anchored by IRO Umar, UBEC. The topic was BESDA implementation: Immediate next steps. The following thematic issues were discussed and agreed as follows:

1. **Set up state teams**
2. A draft Team composition for policy and monitoring under the SMoE was composed for formalization as follows:

* Director, Universal Basic Education
* Director, Quality Assurance
* Director, Planning Research And Statistics
* Director, Finance and Supplies

(ii) Draft Technical team composition under SUBEB for Result Areas

**Result Area (1)**: Increasing equitable access for out-of-school Children in focus States - PDO indicator: Reduced number of out-of-school children in focus States, by gender

* Director, Social Mobilization - Lead Director
* Director, Planning Research & Statistics
* Director, Quality Assurance
* To collaborate with relevant Units

**Result Area (2)** Improving literacy in focus States

PDO indicator: Improved literacy rates in focus States, by State

* Director, Quality Assurance - Lead Director
* To collaborate with relevant Units

**Result Area 3**: Strengthening accountability for result PDO indicator: Publicly disclosed UBE Programme Strategic plan reflecting annual progress reports and programme evaluation finding

* Director, Planning Research & Statistics - Lead Director
* Director, Quality Assurance
* Director, Administration
* To collaborate with relevant Units

1. **Set up state accounts**

Four accounts to be opened with commercial bank; name:

* SMoE/SUBEB BESDA Results Account
* SMoE/SUBEB BESDA Advance Account
* SMoE BESDA Technical Assistant Account
* SUBEB BESDA Technical Assistant Account
* **Account signatories** is to be determined

1. **Complete prior results**

The team commended SUBEB for successful completion of prior results. It was recommended to prioritize the needs.

1. **Request advance**

* The State was advised to request for advance and use judiciously after the setting up programme Team and when account became operational.

1. **Jump-start implementation**

* It was observed with concern that Kebbi State has not gone far beyond prior results and was advised to urgently commence process to qualify for BESDA implementation without further delay.

**4.1.2** **Report on Courtesy Visit to H.E. Abubakar Atiku Bagudu, Executive Governor by Dina Abu Ghaida TTL**

In her brief report; the TTL said she was received at Governor’s residence. She presented the background information on BESDA. She also enumerated challenges of States which include: (a) inability to set up implementation team, (b) lack of BESDA account and signatories.

She informed the technical meeting that H.E. promised to address these challenges in short time.

**4.1.3 Observations/Recommendations**

Members were happy with the presentation and offered observations/ recommendations as follows:

* Cash transfer to girls, a strategy by UNICEF is very encouraging and therefore recommended for adoption in BESDA;
* IQS – Incentives to Mallams should be encouraged
* Tracking of child’s attendance retention through the use of instrument developed by the State is a good initiative. It was recommended for improvement to include biometric capture for authenticity.
* Sustain the post literacy programme supported by UNICEF and National Commission for Mass Literacy to maximise BESDA achievement.
* Efforts should be intensified to access BESDA funds by promptly establishment of the accounts
* Need for work in harmony among team players to achieve objectives of BESDA.

**5.0 CONCLUSION**

The Mission in Kebbi State can be described as very successful, especially considering the excellent accomplishment of almost all mission objectives for the State. It is highly recommended at this stage that the National Programme Coordinator (NPC) and National Coordinating Team (NCT) in UBEC come up with follow-up plans to ensure that the State accomplish the outstanding issues (account/teams) in good time.

**Moses Oyishe**